University of Toronto at Mississauga:
Numata Buddhist Studies Program
26 February, 2010

The Influence of Śaivism on Pāla Buddhism

Alexis Sanderson

Outline

Śaivism: Atimārga (*c.* 2nd century +) (Pāñcārthika Pāśupata → Lākula → Somasiddhantin) and Mantramārga (*c.* 6th c. +). Mantramārga (Tantric Śaivism): Siddhānta, Mantrapīṭha, Vidyāpīṭha.

Co-existence of Buddhism and Śaivism (or Vaiṣṇavism) under royal patronage during the early medieval period: the Viṣṇukuṇḍis of Āndhra, the Maitrakas of Vallabhī, the Vaiṣṇava Kārkoṭas of Kashmir, the Licchavis and Ṭhākurīs of Nepal, the Bhauma-Karas of Orissa, the Candras of S-E Bengal, the Khaḍgas of Samataṭa, the Candras of Arakan, the **Pālas** of Bengal and Bihar, *c.* 750–1199), the Khmers, the Chams, Majapahit eastern Java.

The pre-eminence of the Pālas as patrons of Buddhism:

1. Pālas identified as *paramasaugataḥ* in inscriptions and manuscript colophons. Those for whom we have no such evidence of religious affiliation are given in italics. Those during whose reign the Pāla realm was expansive are given in bold:

   Gopāla I (r. *c.* 750–775: a Buddhist according to the *Rājavyākaraṇa* and Tāranātha's *Rgya gar chos byung*, but no inscriptions or MS colophons confirm this)

   Dharmapāla (r. *c.* 775–812)

   Devapāla (r. *c.* 812–850)

   Śūrapāla I (r. *c.* 850–858)

   Vigrahapāla I (r. *c.* 858–860)

   Mahendrapāla (r. *c.* 850–865+)

   Nārāyaṇapāla (r. *c.* 865+–917)

   Rājyapāla (r. *c.* 917-952)

   Gopāla II (r. *c.* 952–972)

Vigrahapāla II (r. *c.* 972–977)

Mahīpāla I (r. *c.* 977–1027)

Nayapāla (r. *c.* 1027–1043)

Vigrahapāla III (r. *c.* 1043–1070)

Mahīpāla II (r. *c.* 1070-1071)

Śūrapāla II (r. *c.* 1071–1072)

Rāmapāla (r. *c.* 1072–1126)

Kumārapāla (r. *c.* 1126–1128)

Gopāla III (r. *c.* 1128-1143)

Madanapāla (r. *c.* 1143–1161)

Govindapāla (r. *c.* 1161–1165)

Palapāla (r. *c.* 1165–1199)

2. Major royal monastic foundations: Uddaṇḍapuramahāvihāra (Dharmapāla, Trikaṭukavihāra (Dharmapāla), Somapuramahāvihāra (Dharmapāla); Vikramaśīlamahāvihāra (Devapāla [alias Vikramaśīla]); Uruvāsavihāra (a branch monastery of Uddaṇḍapura), and additions to the monastic complexes of Nālandā, Somapura, and Trikaṭuka (works attributed by Tāranātha, to 'Mahāpāla', probably in error for Mahīpāla I); Rāja-Jagaddalamahāvihāra (existed in the time of Rāmapāla; founder unknown).

3. Major east-Indian scholars of the Buddhist Mantranaya:

   (a) Kriyātantra, Caryātantra, and Yogatantra: **Buddhaguhya** (commentaries on *Dhyānottara* (Kriyātantra), *Subāhuparipṛcchā* [Kriyātantra], *Mahāvairocanābhisaṃbodhi* [Caryātantra], *Sarvadurgatipariśodhana* [Yogatantra], and *Sarvatathāgatatattvasaṃgraha* [Yogatantra]),

   (b) Yogatantra: Vilāsavajra (*Nāmasaṃgīti-nāmamantrārthāvalokinī*), **Buddhaśrījñāna** (founder of the Jñānapāda school of *Guhyasamāja* exegesis), Dīpaṅkarabhadra (*Guhyasamājamaṇḍalavidhi*), Ānandagarbha (commentaries on *Sarvatathāgatatattvasaμgraha*, the *Paramādya*, *Māyājāla*, *Guhyasamāja*, and the *Sarvakalpasamuccaya* [the Uttaratantra of the proto-Yoginītantra *Sarvabuddhasamāyoga*]; *Vajrajvālodayā* (a Herukasādhana following the *Sarvabuddhasamāyoga*, and the *Sarvavajrodaya*, a Yogatantra initiation manual), Padmavajra (the *Guhyasamāja*-based *Guhyasiddhi*), Padmaśrīmitra (*[Guhyasamāja-]maṇḍalopāyikā*), Āryadeva (founder of the

Ārya school of *Guhyasamāja* exegesis, author of the *Caryāmelāpakapradīpa*), Nāgārjuna (*Pañcakrama*), Candrakīrti (*Guhyasamāja* comm. [*Pradīpoddyotana*]).

(c) Yoginītantra: **Advayavajra** (Sādhanas of Cakrasaṃvara, Hevajra, and Vajravārāhī, texts of the Mahāmudrā cycle), Alakakalaśa (*Yoginīsaṃcāra* comm.), Kumāracandra (commentaries on the *Herukābhyudaya* and *Anāvila*), Jayabhadra (*Laghuśaṃvara* comm.), Bhavyakīrti (commentary on *Laghuśaṃvara* and the *Pradīpoddyotana* of Candrakīrti), **Durjayacandra** (commentaries on the *Laghuśaṃvara*, *Hevajra*, *Mahāmāyā*, and *Catuṣpīṭha*), **Bhavabhaṭṭa** (commentaries on the *Laghuśaṃvara*, the *Hevajra*, and the *Catuṣpīṭha*), Devagupta (*Laghuśaṃvara* comm.), Kambalapāda (*Laghuśaṃvara* comm.), Ratnarakṣita (*Saṃvarodaya* comm.), Lūyīpāda (*Cakrasaṃvarābhisamaya*), Ghaṇṭāpāda (*Cakrasaṃvarapañcakrama*, *Cakrasaṃvarapañcakramavṛtti*, etc.), two Vīravajras (*Laghuśaṃvara* commentaries), Kṛṣṇa/Kāṇha (*Hevajra* comm.), **Ratnākaraśānti** (commentaries on the *Hevajra*, *Mahāmāyā*, and *Khasama*; the *Bhramahara* [*Hevajrasādhana*]), Saroruha (*Hevajra* comm.), Kelikuliśa (*Hevajra* comm.), Tathāgatarakṣita (commentaries on the *Laghuśaṃvara* and the *Yoginīsaṃcāra*), **Abhayākaragupta** (commentaries on the *Buddhakapāla* [*Abhayapaddhati*] and *Saṃpuṭa* [*Āmnāyamañjarī*]; *Vajrāvalī*, and *Niṣpannayogāvalī*), Śākyarakṣita (*Abhisamayamañjarī* [Vajravārāhī]).

(d) Kālacakra: **Puṇḍarīka** (*Vimalaprabhā*), **Nāropā** (*Sekoddeśaṭīkā*), Anupamarakṣita (*Ṣaḍaṅgayoga*), Raviśrījñāna (*Guṇabharaṇī* [comm. on *Ṣaḍaṅgayoga*), Rāmapāla (*Sekanirdeśapañjikā*), **Vajrapāṇi** (*Kālacakra*-based *Laghuśaṃvara* comm.), **Vajragarbha** (*Kālacakra*-based *Hevajra* comm.).

Pāla patronage of Śaivism:

1. According to the Māldā District Museum copper-plate of Mahendrapāla (*Epigraphia Indica* 42:2), the *paramasaugataḥ* Devapāla built two temples of outstanding beauty during his rule, one for the Buddha and the other for the consort of Śiva: *yo nirmame *sugatasadma gṛhaṃ ca gauryā yat kautukaṃ ca tilakaṃ ca jagattraye 'pi* (,ll. 12–13).

2. The Bhāgalpur copper-plate of Nārāyaṇapāla (r. *c.* 860–917) (*Indian Antiquary* 15, pp. 304–310) calls him a *paramasaugataḥ* but records his establishing a Śiva and granting a village to it and an association of Pāśupatācāryas (*pāśupatācāryapariṣat*) attached to the foundation, and refers to his having founded of a vast number of temples for this deity. Ll. 38–41: *matam astu bhavatāṃ* |

kalaśapote mahārājādhirājaśrīnārāyaṇapāladevena svayaṃkāritasahasrāyatanasya tatra pratiṣṭhāpitasya bhagavataḥ śivabhaṭṭārakasya pāśupata-ācāryapariṣadaś ca.

3. A temple built by *paramasaugataḥ* Nayapāla for the emaciated goddess Carcā (Carcikā/Cāmuṇḍā) established by the *paramasaugataḥ* Mahendrapāla. The Siyān stone slab inscription of Nayapāla, *Epigraphia Indica* 39:7, v. 40: *mahe[ndra]pālacarcāyā mahendrasadṛśodayaḥ | yaḥ śailīṃ vaḍabhīṃ śaile sopānena sahākarot*.

4. A monastery bestowed on the Saiddhāntika Guru Indraśiva by *paramasaugataḥ* Mahīpāla I, described in this context as a 'knower of reality' (*tattvavit*), i.e. a Śaiva initiate. The Bāṇgarh Praśasti of Mūrtiśiva (ed. Sircar, *Journal of Ancient Indian History* 13 [1983], Parts 1–2, 1980–82, pp. 34–56), ll. 8–9: 9 *śrīmān indraśivaḥ sphuṭaṃ hariharaprāyāṃ śivendrākṛtiṃ bibhrad vaṃśavibhūṣaṇaṃ samabhavac chisyo 'sya puṇyātmanaḥ | yasmai kāñcanapuñjamañjuracitaprāsādamerusphuratkailāsābhamaṭhaṃ dadāv iha mahīpālo nṛpas tattvavit*

5. The Sārnāth pedestal inscription of Mahīpāla I (*Indian Antiquary* 14, pp. 139–140), dated in 1026, reports that Mahīpāla I had hundreds of temples of Śiva, Citraghaṇṭā, and other [Śaiva] deities built in Benares: *īśānacitraghaṇṭādikīrtiratnaśatāni yau | gauḍādhipo mahīpālaḥ kāśyāṃ śrīmān akārayat* ||

6. The *paramasaugataḥ* Nayapāla had as his royal preceptor (*gauḍarājaguruḥ*) the Saiddhāntika Guru Sarvaśiva, who was a successor of Indraśiva, and who, when he retired, passed on this office to his brother Mūrtiśiva. Ibid. ll. 11–12: *rājño śrīnayapālasya gurus tattvavidāṃ varaḥ | śrīmān sarvaśivas tasya śisyo 'bhūd bhūṣaṇam bhuvaḥ*; ll. 13–14: *yenāvarjitagauḍarājagurutālakṣmīr nijabhrātari śrīmān mūrtiśive niveśya vipināvāsaṃ svayam vāñchatā | kṣīrodārṇavavamanthanotthitamilallakṣmīṃ svaśisye harāv āropyāharato viṣaṃ paśupater vṛttāntam udghāṭitam*.

7. The Siyān stone slab inscription (*EI* 39:7) records Nayapāla's numerous religious foundations. Almost all are Śākta Śaiva. None are Buddhist.

8. Nayapāla's son and successor *paramasaugataḥ* Vigrahapāla III described in his Āṃgāchi copper-plate inscription as 'devoted to Śiva's worship'. *Epigraphia Indica* 15:18, ll. 17–19 (v. 12): *pīta<ḥ> sajjanalocanaiḥ* ***smararipoḥ pūjānuraktaḥ sadā*** *saṃgrāme caturo 'dhikaś ca haritaḥ kālaḥ kule vidviṣām | cāturvarṇyasamāśrayaḥ sitayaśaḥpuñjair jagad rañjayan śrīmadvigrahapāladevanṛpatir jajñe tato dhāmabhṛt* ||

9. In the twelfth century the South-Indian Saiddhāntika Trilocanaśiva tells us that his preceptorial line reached him from a Dharmaśambhu (Dharmaśiva) who had held office as the royal preceptor of "the king of Gauḍa" through three intervening preceptorial generations. The chronology indicates that this was probably the *paramasaugataḥ* Rāmapāla (r. *c.* 1072–1126). *Somaśambhupaddhativyākhyā*, colophonic verses (IFP, MS Transcripts 457 [**T1**] and 170 [**T2**]; edition in Brunner 1963–1998, Pt. 4, pp. 422–427 [**B**]): *tadvaṃśajaḥ śivamatāgamalakṣavettā śrīdharmaśambhur iti* ***gauḍapatīndranāthaḥ***.

10. The poet Saṃdhyākaranandin describes Madanapāla (*paramasaugataḥ*) as a devotee of Śiva (*Rāmacarita* 4.35b: *śivapraṇayī*) and as having attained his success in war through the favour of Caṇḍī (*Rāmacarita* 4.21ab: *caṇḍīcaraṇasarojaprasādasaṃpannavigrahaśrīkam*).

The Śaiva Influence on Pāla Buddhism. The co-existence of Buddhism and Śaivism was facilitated by the fact that the form of Buddhism adopted and developed was one that had equipped itself with:

1. a pantheon of ordered sets of deities
2. a repertoire of Tantric ceremonies that parallelled that of the Śaivas and indeed had modelled itself upon it:
   (a) Maṇḍala initiation
   (b) a system of worship animated by the principle of identification with the deity of initiation (*devatāhaṃkāraḥ*, *devatāgarvaḥ*) through the use of Mantras, Mudrās, visualization, and fire-sacrifice (*homaḥ*)
   (c) the claim that it could bestow not only Buddha-hood [in this life] but also the production of supernatural effects (*siddhiḥ*) : *śāntikam*, *pauṣṭikam*, *abhicāraḥ*, and control of the rain (*varṣāpaṇam* and *ativṛṣṭidhāraṇam*)
   (d) ceremonies for patrons in the public domain: for the consecration (*pratiṣṭhā*) of temple images (*pratimā*), paintings of deities on cloth (*paṭaḥ*), manuscripts of sacred texts (*pustakam*), monasteries (*vihāraḥ*), shrines (*gandhakuṭī*), Caityas, reservoirs (*puṣkariṇyādi*), gardens and the like (*ārāmādi*)
   (e) Buddhist funeral rite (*antyeṣṭiḥ*) for initiates.

That this transformation of the Mahāyāna had been achieved by absorbing and adapting non-Buddhist practices was, of course, evident from the beginning:

1. The Caryātantra *Mahāvairocanābhisaṃbodhi* (7th century) (*rNam par snang mdzad chen po mngon par byang chub pa'i rgyud*, f. 177r1–3): *de la gsang ba'i bdag po ma 'ongs pa'i dus na sems can blo zhan pa ma dad pa gang dag bstan pa'i de la dad par mi 'gyur zhing yid gnyis dang som nyi mang ba | thos pa tsam snying po ma 'dzin pa | sgrub ma la mi phyogs pa dag 'byung bar 'gyur te | de dag ni bdag nyid kyang ma rung la gzhan yang phung bar byed pa yin no | 'di skad du 'di ni phyi rol pa rnams la yod de | sangs rgyas rnams kyi gsungs pa ni ma yin no zhes smra bar 'gyur gyi*. 'O [Vajrapāṇi,] Lord of the Yakṣas, in time to come there will arise people of inferior understanding and no faith who will not believe this teaching. They will dissent and have many doubts. They will hear it but they will not take it to heart and they will refuse to put it into practice. Being themselves unworthy they will bring others too to ruin. [For] they will say that this is not the teaching of the Buddhas but belongs to the outsiders'.

2. The Kriyātantra *Mañjuśriyamūlakalpa* (up to late 8th century) 2.32–34b: *eṣa mantro mayā proktaḥ sattvānāṃ hitakāmyayā | śūlamudrāsamāyuktaḥ sarvabhūtavināśakaḥ* || 33 *yan mayā kathitaṃ pūrvaṃ kalpam asya purātanam | *śaivaṃ tad* (conj. : *śaivam* Ed.) *iti vakṣyante sattvā bhūtalavāsinaḥ* || 34 *vividhā guṇavistārāḥ śaivatantre mayoditāḥ* 'I have taught this Mantra [of Śiva] which together with the trident Mudrā destroys all demons, out of my desire to benefit living beings. Those living on the earth will say that its ancient Kalpa, that I taught in former times, was taught by Śiva. [But] the various excellent extensive [Kalpas] in the Śaiva Tantras are in fact my teachings'.

3. 47.53–54: *sarvaṃ śaivam iti khyātaṃ sarvair bhūtalavāsibhiḥ | mayaiva nigaditaṃ pūrvaṃ kalpe-m asmiṃ savistare* || 54 *paścād anyo janaḥ prāhuḥ kalpamantrāṃ pṛthak pṛthak | *tumburoḥ* (corr. : *tumburuḥ* Ed.) *sārthavāhasya tryambakasya tu *dhīmataḥ* (corr. : *dhīmateḥ* Ed.) 'It was I that first taught, in this vast Kalpa, everything that the inhabitants of earth without exception refer to as the teaching of Śiva. It was only later that others taught in the various texts [considered to be taught by him] the Kalpamantras of the wise Śiva Tumburu the Trader'.

Stages of the śāktization of the Buddhist Mantranaya:

1. *Sarvatathāgatatattvasaṃgraha* (end of the seventh century, expanded in the eighth);

   (a) *āveśaḥ*.

(b) Section 2: Vajraguhyamaṇḍala, in which the five Tathāgatas are replaced by goddesses (§§319–327): Vairocana at the centre by Vajradhātvīśvarī and, around her in the four directions, Akṣobhya by Vajravajriṇī, Ratnasambhava by Ratnavajriṇī, Amitāyus by Dharmavajriṇī, and Amoghasiddhi by Karmavajriṇī. §322: "Ah, how benevolent is the Bodhicitta to all beings! For the Buddhas take on even female form to accord with [the expectations of] their disciples (*vineyavaśāt*)".

(c) incorporation of sexual intercourse into the activities of worship as a higher form of practice (*niḥśaṅkācāraḥ*).

2. *Guhyasamāja* (8th century): copulating deities, sexual initiation rites, and the sacralization of impurity

3. *Sarvabuddhasamāyogaḍākinījālaśaṃvara* (8th century): Heruka and his Yoginīs, Kāpālika iconography, the Gaṇamaṇḍala, and the first signs of Śaiva-Buddhist intertextuality (←*Vīṇāśikha*).

4. The Cakrasaṃvara texts (*Laghuśaṃvara*/*Cakrasaṃvara*/*Laghvabhidhāna* [first commentary in the early tenth century], *Herukābhyudaya*, *Vajraḍāka*, *Abhidhānottara*, *Yoginīsaṃcāra*, *Caturyoginīsaṃpuṭa*, *Saṃvarodaya*, and *Ḍākārṇava*): the full appropriation of the Śākta Śaivism of the Vidyāpīṭha (*Picumata*, *Tantrasadbhāva*, *Yoginīsaṃcāraprakaraṇa*, *Siddhayogeśvarīmata*, *Niśisaṃcāra*):

   (a) Śaṃvara/Vajrarudra and Vajravārāhī: the transformation of Bhairava and his consort.

   (b) The rise of the goddess to independence.

   (c) The adoption of the Vidyāpīṭha's Caryā and Yoga

      i. Vidyāpīṭha's Kāpālika mode of post-initiatory observance (*caryāvratam*

      ii. The pan-Indian topography of the Śākta Śaivas' sacred sites, their Pīṭhas, Kṣetras, Upakṣetras, Saṃdohas/Chandohas and the like (*Laghuśaṃvara* and *Vajraḍāka*).

      iii. The practice of visiting these sacred sites (*pīṭhabhramaṇam*) in search of meetings with the Yoginīs/Ḍākinīs that are believed to frequent them and to be incarnate there in human women enlightened from birth or in childhood.

      iv. Classifying such women as belonging to one or other a fixed number of deity-clans (*kulam*) and of specifying various characteristics of

appearance and behaviour that enable the adept to determine these clan-affiliations.

v. Consumption and offering of meat and alcoholic liquor in their rites.

vi. The consumption of foul substances without inhibition as an initiatory test of nondual awareness.

vii. The sacrifice and consumption of the flesh of human beings believed to have been reincarnated seven times for this purpose (*saptāvartaḥ*) and the use of their skulls as skull-bowls.

viii. The practice of visualizations in which the Sādhaka enters the body of a victim through the channels of his vital energy (*nāḍī*), extracts his vital essences, and draws them into himself.

ix. Yogically raising one's consciousness out of one's body through the central channel as a means of ending one's life and ascending to a paradise or liberation, (*utkrāntiḥ*, Tib. *'pho ba*).

x. The adaptation of this practice as a means of assisting the dying and the dead.

xi. The practice of transferring one's consciousness out of one's body to pass into and animate a corpse (*parakāyapraveśaḥ*).

xii. The Yoga of the three Nāḍīs.

Converting the Outsiders:

1. Rājānaka Jayadratha (13th century), *Haracaritacintāmaṇi* 13.61–86

2. The prominence of Śāktism in eastern India before and during the time of the Pālas:

   (a) Prominence of eastern India in the earliest canonical lists of Śākta sacred sites (Pīṭhas, Sandohas etc.). *Mādhavakula* in *Tantrālokaviveka* on 29.67; *Tantrāloka* 15.83c–88; *Kularatnoddyota* f. 13r3–4; *Niśisaṃcāra* f. 15v3–4; *Kubjikāmata* 22.32–38.

   (b) Carcikā /Cāmuṇḍā/Kālarātri of Koṭivarṣa/Devīkoṭṭa (*Skandapurāṇa-Ambikākhaṇḍa* [*Adhyāya* 171], *Picumata*, *Niśisaṃcāra*), Puṇḍravardhana (*Niśisaṃcāra*, *Kubjikāmata*), and Ekāmra (*Niśisaṃcāra*, *Kubjikāmata*).

   (c) Hill-top temple of Carcikā established by Mahendrapāla and renovated by Nayapāla (Siyān stone slab inscription).

   (d) Carcikā temple established near Koṭivarṣa by Saiddāntika Mūrtiśiva, Rājaguru of Nayapāla.

(e) The prominence of Śākta foundations in the Siyān stone slab inscription of Nayapāla.

(f) Many images of Carcikā have been found at sites in Bihar, West Bengal, Bangladesh, and Orissa, dating from the ninth century to the fourteenth.

(g) Carcikā's prominence in the east-Indian Śākta *Devīpurāṇa*; see especially Paṭalas 7 and 9.

(h) Her presence with Bhairava beneath the feet of Cakrasaṃvara and Vajravārāhī.

3. Śraddhākaravarman, **Yoganiruttaratantrārthāvatārasaṃgraha*, referring to the Yogatantras as the Tantras of Method (Upāyatantras) and to the Yoginītantras as the Tantras of Wisdom (Prajñātantras) (*rNal 'byor bla na med pa'i rgyud kyi don la 'jugs pa bsdus pa*, DT, vol. 78, pp. 212, l. 7–213, l. 3: ff. 103v7–104r3): 'A Method Tantra is one in which the Maṇḍala shows mainly male deities in order to train (*vinī-*) men and insiders (*svayūthya-*), whereas a Wisdom Tantra is one in which, in order to train women and non-Buddhist outsiders (*bāhyatīrthika-*), the Maṇḍala shows mainly female deities, deities, that is, who are appropriate for these. A Method Tantra is one that exhibits deities that purify the outer and inner aggregates of personality (*skandhāḥ*), the elements (*dhātavaḥ*), and the faculties and their objects (*āyatanāni*), whereas a Wisdom Tantra is one that exhibits deities that purify the outer and inner channels of the vital energy (*nāḍī*) and the Bodhicitta [semen]. A Method Tantra is one that exhibits deities [whose appearance and conduct are] in conformity with the [norms of] the world, whereas a Wisdom Tantra is one that exhibits deities [whose appearance is] contrary to [these norms of] the world'.

4. Ānandagarbha, *gSang ba 'dus pa'i dka' grel*, f. 4r3–5: 'If it is asked why he was residing in their private parts, the answer is [that this is] in order to bring it about that those devoted to the Tantras of Viṣṇu and the other [gods], who have not yet abandoned [their attachment to] the objects of the senses, may come through desire itself to delight in the abandoning of desire. For they seek to attain the Siddhis of such [gods] as Viṣṇu by resorting to women, and using such [offerings] as beef and urine. Those engaged in the quest for the Siddhis taught by these [gods do indeed] copulate with women [for this purpose]. For [it is said in their texts]: "Viṣṇu is Bhagavān ['the possessor of *bhaga-*'] in that he resides in the genitals (*bhaga-*) of women. He is called Nārāyaṇa [for the same reason,] because [by residing there] he gives pleasure to men"'.